Problem Motivation:
The problem is applied research. The use cases the speaker related to finding the nearest facilities (Restaurants, gas stations etc) based on the users current location which can be useful in a mobile app.

Problem Statement:
The talk was on finding the nearest facilities along a spatial network based on the position of the user and the distance threshold. The input and output was clearly defined with examples to make the problem statement clear. Constraints were not listed in the problem statement.

Challenges:
The challenges are clearly articulated. The challenges listed were basically the poor performance of the existing methods. Some more emphasis on the challenges in the current method would make the project more effective.

Proposed Approach:
The talk explained the key elements of the proposed approach clearly. There were examples provided for better understanding. The key points are:
- Path Neighborhood
- Facility Neighborhood

Novel/Better:
The talk defined the clear cut classification of related work. The novelty of the proposed approach quite clear from the classification scheme used in the talk.

Validation:
Validation methodology though not mentioned explicitly would be the space occupied and query time for different approaches.

Presentation Critique:
We would rate the talk as 8 on 10. The speakers were able to address all the questions in an effective manner.

- Was the talk accessible to an "intelligent lay person"? Yes, it had examples for understanding.
- Did the talk emphasize a central message that conveys the overall value of the work being executed? Yes
- Did the talk attempt to relate to the audience and showed effort in conveying key ideas clearly? Yes, the ideas were conveyed clearly.
- Was the speaker’s response to questions satisfactory? Yes, the speakers were able to answer the questions effectively.
- How did the talk do on covering the 6 elements? Kindly rate each element separately and include a brief justification for each.
  - Motivation - 9/10: Clearly mentioned the societal aspect of the problem.
  - Problem Statement- 7/10: Input, output explained with an example. Constraints missing.
  - Challenges - 8/10: Clearly articulated challenges. Scope to explain more
  - Proposed Approach - 10/10: Clearly articulated the approach.
  - Novel/Better - 9/10: Clearly defined classification. Scope to explain more
Validation Methodology - 7/10: Experimental evaluation is listed as a future work. Would have been nice to see some level of evaluation to compare with existing methods