**Problem Motivation:** What kind of research (e.g. Basic or Applied research) did the talk relate to? If it was basic research what fundamental questions or open problems did the speaker relate to? If it was applied research, what application use cases / examples/ questions did the speaker relate to? Do they have societal significance / are they made up? If they are made up what are some realistic application questions that can be addressed? Briefly explain within 75 words.

The talk related to the new and evolving field of spatio-temporal data mining. The field can be applied to the areas like flow-anomalies, co-occurrence patterns and trajectories of movies objects. The presenters clearly articulated the societal importance of the emerging field. Moreover the presenters talked about the emerging trends and the new research areas where spatio temporal data mining is applied.

**Problem Statement:** What research problem / software prototype did the talk attempt to solve / build? Are the listed constraints reasonable? Why or Why not? Was the input / output well defined or easy to understand via a simple example? (75 word limit).

The problem statement was clearly stated in the outline slide by means of introduction of pattern families and tasks. The presentation next goes in detail about the different pattern families.

**Challenges:** Are the challenges articulated clearly (and possibly illustrated via an example)? If so what are they and identify their category (e.g. computational, statistical, others). Briefly describe some improvements that can help articulating challenges easier? (75 Word limit)

This presentation caters to a book chapter and thus did not include the challenges involved in spatio-temporal data mining paradigm. Each of the pattern families have different challenges which can be found in the respective research papers.

**Proposed Approach:** Did the talk explain the key elements of the proposed approach clearly via the use of suitable examples? If so what were the key elements? Did the proposed approach honor all the constraints listed in the problem statement while achieving the goals listed in the problem or where there some (simplyfying) assumptions? If so what were they? Briefly explain (and possibly include suggestions to improve the proposed approach to solve the stated problem).(150 Word Limit)

NA

**Novel/Better:** Did the talk give a reasonable (e.g. thorough / acceptable) classification of related work and identify their limitations via examples? Was the novelty of the proposed approach clear from the classification scheme used in the talk? If not how can it be improved? Did the talk emphasize on how the proposed approach was better with respect to related work via additional examples? If not how can
Validation: Did the talk provide hints about the validation methodology or provide examples to validate their contribution claims? (50 Word Limit)

NA

Presentation Critique: Rate the talk on a scale of 0 (poor) to 10 (excellent) and provide a brief justification (50 Words) while suggesting areas for improvement on the following:

- Was the talk accessible to an "intelligent lay person"?: 9 (You need to know the basics to understand families like cascading pattern and co-occurrence family)
- Did the talk emphasize a central message that conveys the overall value of the work being executed?: 10
- Did the talk attempt to relate to the audience and showed effort in conveying key ideas clearly?: 10
- Was the speaker's response to questions satisfactory?: 8
- How did the talk do on covering the 6 elements? Kindly rate each element separately and include a brief justification for each.
  - Problem: 10: Very clearly stated
  - Motivation: 10: Societal importance and applications discussed
  - Challenges: 8: Very hard to judge.
  - Approach: 10: Pattern Families discussed